Situation
Boat A sailed 5 races in a qualifying series (races Q1-Q5) in which there was more than one fleet, and she qualified for the gold fleet in a subsequent final series of the regatta. There were 5 races scheduled in the final series (races F1-F5) and a boat’s series score would be calculated from the scores from all of races Q1 to Q5 and F1 to F5.

Boat A sailed races F1 and F2 and finished first in both. In race F3, she was damaged beyond repair by a boat that was breaking a rule of part 2. She could not finish race F3 and could not sail in races F4 and F5. The protest committee decided that boat A was entitled to redress but that the redress given could not be based on her results in races Q1-Q5 because there was more than one fleet in those races. Instead, they decided that her score in races F3, F4 and F5 should be the same as a first place, which was the average of her results in races F1 and F2.

Question 1
Did the protest committee comply with Case 116?

Answer 1
Yes.
Case 116 requires that when giving redress, less than half of a boat’s race scores included in her series score are based on average points. In this situation, the boat in question has finished in 7 out of 10 races, therefore less than half her race scores were based on average points.

Question 2
In making this decision, did the protest committee determine the correct redress?

Answer 2
It depends.
Case 116 limits the number of races for which average points may be given but is silent regarding how the average points are calculated. When the protest committee decides that a boat is entitled to redress under rule 62, it shall make as fair an arrangement as possible for all boats affected, whether or not they asked for redress. Depending on the boat’s scores in the qualification races, calculating the average on just two races might be unfair to the other boats, as it almost certainly excludes the chances of any other boat winning the event. Other options available to the protest committee would be to include races Q1 to Q5 when calculating the average score, to take into account the competitive differences between the qualifying and the final series, or to give redress only in race F3.